

# On some Properties of Estimators of a Probability Density

M. A. MIRZACHMEDOV, SH. A. CHASHIMOV

Let  $X_1, X_2, \dots, X_n$  be mutually independent and identically distributed  $s$ -dimensional random vectors with a probability density  $p(x) \in L_2$ .

Consider the class of estimators  $\hat{p}_n(x)$  of the form

$$\hat{p}_n(x) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n p_n(x - X_k)$$

for estimating of the density  $p(x)$ , where  $p_n(x) \in L_2$ . In this paper some consistency properties of estimators in the sense of mean integral square error are studied.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Let

$$X_k = (X_{k1}, \dots, X_{ks}), \quad k = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

be a random sample with a sample size  $n$  from a distribution  $F(x)$ ,  $x \in R^s$ , with the probability density  $p(x) \in L_2$ , i.e.  $X_1, \dots, X_n$  are mutually independent and identically distributed  $s$ -dimensional random vectors with the density  $p(x) \in L_2(R^s)$ .

Consider the class of estimators  $p_n(x)$  of the form

$$\hat{p}_n(x) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n p_n(x - X_k)$$

for estimating of the density  $p(x)$ , where  $p_n(x) \in L_2$ . The quality of the estimators is defined by the mean integral square error (MISE)

$$I_n = E \int_{R^s} [\hat{p}_n(x) - p(x)]^2 dx.$$

Let

$$f_1(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p(x) dx, \quad f_2(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} \hat{p}_n(x) dx,$$

$$f_3(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p_n(x) dx,$$

where  $(t, x) = \sum_{k=1}^s t_k \cdot x_k$  is the inner product of two elements  $t$  and  $x$  of  $R^s$ .

It is proved in [1] and [2] that

$$(1) \quad I_n = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^s} \int_{R^s} \left\{ \frac{1}{n} |f_3(t)|^2 \cdot [1 - |f_1(t)|^2] + |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot [1 - f_3(t)]^2 \right\} dt$$

and if

$$f_3(t) = f_3^*(t) = \frac{n|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2},$$

$$f_3^*(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p_n^*(x) dx,$$

where

$$p_n^*(x) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^s} \int_{R^s} e^{-i(t,x)} f_3^*(t) dt,$$

then the minimum of  $I_n$  is reached and

$$(2) \quad I_n^* = \min I_n = \frac{p_n^*(0, 0, \dots, 0)}{n} = O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right).$$

## 2. ASYMPTOTIC BEHAVIOUR OF $I_n^*$

For the sake of simplicity only the bivariate case is considered and asymptotic behaviour (if  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ) of  $I_n^*$  is studied.

We say (see [3]), that the characteristic function  $f_1(t)$  decreases exponentially with respect to coefficients  $p_i > 0$  and with respect to  $t_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ) if the following conditions are satisfied:

(a)  $|f_1(t)| \leq A e^{-(p, |t|)}$ , for some constant  $A > 0$  and for all  $t$ ,

(b)  $\lim_{v_1 \rightarrow \infty} \lim_{v_2 \rightarrow \infty} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 [1 + e^{(p, v)} \cdot |f_1(v_1 t_1, v_2 t_2)|^2]^{-1} dt = 0,$

where

$$(p, |t|) = p_1 \cdot |t_1| + p_2 \cdot |t_2|, \quad (p, v) = p_1 v_1 + p_2 v_2.$$

244 The case when the characteristic function  $f_1(t)$  decreases algebraically of degree  $p_i > 0$  with respect to arguments  $t_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ) was considered in [1], [2].

**Definition.** Let  $\varphi(n)$  be some function of  $n$  and let  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(n) = \infty$ . The estimator  $\hat{p}_n(x)$  is said to be *integrally consistent of order*  $\varphi(n)$  if

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(n) \cdot I_n = a \quad \text{where } 0 < a < \infty$$

(see [4]).

**Theorem 1.** Let the characteristic function  $f_1(t)$  decrease exponentially with respect to coefficients  $p_i > 0$  and arguments  $t_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ). Then the estimator  $\hat{p}_n^*(x)$  is integrally consistent of order  $n/\ln^2 n$ , namely:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \cdot I_n^* = \frac{1}{8\pi^2 p_1 p_2}.$$

**Proof.**

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2} dt - \int_{R^2} \frac{\exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, |t|)]} dt = \\ & = \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2 - \exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2][1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, |t|)]]} dt = L. \end{aligned}$$

Denote

$$v_1 = \frac{\ln(n-1)}{2p_1}, \quad v_2 = \frac{\ln(n-1)}{2p_2}.$$

Using the condition (a), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |L| & \leq 4(A^2 + 1) \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2(p, t)] dt_1 dt_2}{[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2][1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, t)]]} \leq \\ & \leq 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \int_0^{v_1} \int_0^{v_2} \frac{dt_1 dt_2}{(n-1)[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2]} + \right. \\ & \left. + \int_{v_1}^\infty \int_{v_2}^\infty e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 + \int_0^{v_1} \int_{v_2}^\infty e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 + \int_{v_1}^\infty \int_0^{v_2} e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 \right\} = L_1. \end{aligned}$$

Then, denoting

$$t_1 = v_1 s_1, \quad t_2 = v_2 s_2,$$

$$\begin{aligned}
L_1 &= 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \frac{1}{n-1} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 \frac{v_1 v_2 \, ds_1 \, ds_2}{1 + \exp[(p, v)] \cdot |f_1(v_1 s_1, v_2, s_2)|^2} + \right. \\
&\quad + \int_1^\infty \int_1^\infty v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 + \int_0^1 \int_1^\infty v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 + \\
&\quad \left. + \int_1^\infty \int_0^1 v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 \right\} = \\
&= 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4p_1 p_2(n-1)} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 \frac{ds_1 \, ds_2}{1 + \exp[(p, v)] \cdot |f_1(v_1 s_1, v_2 s_2)|^2} + \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2p_1 p_2(n-1)} - \frac{1}{4p_1 p_2(n-1)^2} \right\}.
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore,  $L \rightarrow 0$  if  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .

Let us consider the following integral

$$\begin{aligned}
K_n &= \int_{R^2} \frac{\exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{1 + (n-1) \exp[-2(p, |t|)]} \, dt = \\
&= -\frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} \int_0^\infty dt_1 \int_0^\infty d \ln [1 + (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1} e^{-2p_2 t_2}] = \\
&= \frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} \int_0^\infty \ln [1 + (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1}] \, dt_1 = \frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} Q_n.
\end{aligned}$$

Let  $x = (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1}$ , then

$$Q_n = \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_0^{n-1} \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx = \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_0^1 \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx + \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_1^{n-1} \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx.$$

Calculations of the two last integral give (see [5])

$$Q_n = \frac{\pi^2}{24p_1} + \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4p_1} + \frac{1}{2p_1} \cdot \psi(n),$$

where

$$\psi(n) = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k)^2 \cdot (n-1)^{2k}} - \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k-1)^2 \cdot (n-1)^{2k-1}}.$$

It is easy to verify that

$$|\psi(n)| < \frac{1}{n-2}.$$

$$K_n = \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{2p_1p_2(n-1)} + \frac{\pi^2}{12p_1p_2(n-1)} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

Therefore if  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , then

$$\frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1) \cdot |f_1(t)|^2} dt \rightarrow \frac{1}{2p_1p_2}.$$

Thus, from expression (2) with  $s = 2$  the statement of the Theorem 1 follows.

Hence, Theorem 1 is proved.

### 3. ASYMPTOTIC BEHAVIOUR OF $I_n$

The estimator  $\hat{p}_n(x)$  is said to be of an *exponential type* if

$$(3) \quad f_3(t) = h(A_n \cdot e^{x|t_1|}, A_n \cdot e^{x|t_2|}),$$

where

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = 0, \quad |h(t)| \leq B, \quad h(t) \in L_2, \quad t \in R^2.$$

Let us consider the following condition:

$$(4) \quad |1 - h(t)| \leq B_1 |t_1 t_2| \quad \text{for all } |t_i| \leq 1, \quad i = 1, 2.$$

**Theorem 2.** Let  $f_1(t)$  satisfy the condition (a), let the estimator  $\hat{p}_n(x)$  be of an exponential type, let the function  $h(t)$  satisfy (4) and let

$$A_n = D \cdot n^{-b}, \quad b > \frac{1}{2}, \quad \alpha \leq p_i \quad (i = 1, 2).$$

Then the estimator  $\hat{p}_n(x)$  is integrally consistent of order  $n/\ln^2 n$ , namely:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \cdot I_n = \left( \frac{b}{\pi \alpha} \right)^2.$$

First we formulate two lemmas.

**Lemma 1.** Under the conditions of Theorem 2 we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 = b^2.$$

**Proof.**

$$\begin{aligned}
 (5) \quad & \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 = \\
 & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{dt_1 dt_2}{t_1 \cdot t_2} - \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{1 - h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \\
 & + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_1^{\infty} \int_1^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_1^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \\
 & + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_1^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 .
 \end{aligned}$$

The first term of (5) tends to  $b^2$  if  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . It follows from conditions (4) and  $h(t_1, t_2) \in L_2$ , that the other terms of (5) tend to zero if  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .

Lemma 1 is proved.

**Lemma 2.** Under the conditions of Theorem 2 we have

$$\int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = o\left(\frac{\ln^2 n}{n}\right).$$

**Proof.**

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = \\
 & = \frac{4n}{\ln^2 n} \int_0^{\infty} \int_0^{\infty} |f_1(t_1, t_2)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t_1, t_2)|^2 dt_1 dt_2 = Q .
 \end{aligned}$$

Denote

$$x_1 = Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha t_1}, \quad x_2 = Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha t_2}.$$

Then we have

$$\begin{aligned}
 Q &= n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \left| f_1 \left[ \frac{1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{n^b}{D} x_1 \right), \frac{1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{n^b}{D} x_2 \right) \right] \right|^2 \cdot \\
 &\quad \cdot \frac{|1 - h(x_1, x_2)|^2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} dx_1 dx_2 \leq n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 A^2 \cdot \\
 &\quad \cdot \exp \left\{ -2 \left[ \frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} B_1^2 \frac{x_1 x_2}{\alpha^2} dx_1 dx_2 + \\
 &\quad + n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_1^{\infty} \int_1^{\infty} (1 + B)^2 A^2 \exp \left\{ -2 \left[ \frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} .
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \cdot \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} + n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_1^\infty \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 (1+B)^2 A^2 \exp \left\{ -2 \left[ \frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \right. \right. \\ & \left. \left. + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} + n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_1^\infty (1+B)^2 A^2 \cdot \\ & \cdot \exp \left\{ -2 \left[ \frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} = Q_1 + Q_2 + Q_3 + Q_4. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $p_i \geq \alpha$ ,  $2b > 1$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} Q_1 & \leq n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{A^2 B_1^2}{\alpha^2} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] x_1 dx_1. \\ & \cdot \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) x_2 dx_2 = n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{A^2 B_1^2}{\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} (b \ln n - \ln D)^2 \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0, \right. \\ Q_2 & \leq n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \int_1^\infty \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_1. \\ & \cdot \int_1^\infty \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_2 = n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0, \\ Q_3 & \leq n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \frac{dx_1}{x_1}. \\ & \cdot \int_1^\infty \exp \left[ -2 \ln \left( \frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_2 = n \left( \frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{2\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} \frac{(n^{2b} - 1)}{D^2} \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0. \end{aligned}$$

Also

$$Q_4 \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0.$$

**Lemma 2** is proved.

**Proof of Theorem 2.** It follows from (1) that

$$\begin{aligned} n \left( \frac{2\pi}{\ln n} \right)^2 I_n & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_3(t)|^2 [1 - |f_1(t)|^2]^2 dt + \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = \\ & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} h^2(Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_1|}, Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_2|}) dt - \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} h^2(Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_1|}, Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_2|}). \\ & \cdot |f_1(t)|^2 dt + \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt. \end{aligned}$$

The first term of the last expression tends to  $(2b/\alpha)^2$  if  $n \rightarrow \infty$  according to Lemma 1.

The second term tends to zero since  $|h(t)| \leq B$  for all  $(t_1, t_2)$ .

The third term tends also to zero according to Lemma 2.

Thus

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} I_n = \left( \frac{b}{\pi \alpha} \right)^2.$$

Hence Theorem 2 is proved.

#### 4. EXAMPLES

The following examples show that the order of consistency of an estimator can be reached.

**Example 1.** Let us consider the probability density of the form

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{\pi^2(1+x^2)(1+y^2)}.$$

Obviously,

$$f(t_1, t_2) = e^{-|t_1|-|t_2|}.$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} p_n^*(0, 0) &= \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2t_1 - 2t_2]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2t_1 - 2t_2]} dt_1 dt_2 = \\ &= \frac{n \ln^2(n-1)}{8\pi^2(n-1)} + \frac{n}{48(n-1)} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Thus if  $n \rightarrow \infty$

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{8\pi^2} \frac{\ln^2 n}{n} + \frac{1}{48} \frac{1}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

**Example 2.** Now, we also consider the density of Cauchy distribution

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \frac{1}{(1+x^2+y^2)^{3/2}}.$$

In this case

$$f(t_1, t_2) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_{R^2} \exp[i(t_1 x + t_2 y)] p(x, y) dx dy = \exp[-\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}],$$

and

$$p_n^*(0, 0) = \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}]} dt_1 dt_2.$$

**250** Using the polar coordinates  $t_1 = \varrho \cos \theta$ ,  $t_2 = \varrho \sin \theta$  we have

$$p_n^*(0, 0) = \frac{n}{4\pi(n-1)} \left[ \frac{\pi^2}{24} + \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \right].$$

Hence

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{16\pi} \frac{\ln^2 n}{n} + \frac{\pi}{96} \frac{1}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

**Example 3.** At last we consider an example where the characteristic function decreases more rapidly than a characteristic function with properties (a), (b). Denote the density of the bivariate normal distribution by  $p(x, y)$ , i.e.

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{2\pi\sqrt{1-r^2}} \exp\left\{-\frac{1}{2(1-r^2)} [x^2 - 2rxy + y^2]\right\}, \quad r^2 \neq 1.$$

Obviously

$$f(t_1, t_2) = \exp\{-\frac{1}{2}[t_1^2 + 2rt_1t_2 + t_2^2]\}.$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} p_n^*(0, 0) &= \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{|f(t_1, t_2)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f(t_1, t_2)|^2} dt_1 dt_2 = \\ &= \frac{n}{\pi^2} \int_0^{\pi/2} d\theta \int_0^\infty \frac{\varrho \exp[-(\varrho^2 + r\varrho^2 \sin 2\theta)]}{1 + (n-1) \exp[-(\varrho^2 + r\varrho^2 \sin 2\theta)]} d\varrho. \end{aligned}$$

Thus (see [5])

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{2\pi^2\sqrt{1-r^2}} \left[ \frac{\pi}{2} - \arctg \frac{r}{\sqrt{1-r^2}} \right] \frac{\ln n}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right).$$

The example 3 shows that the order of consistency of the estimator is the best possible in this case.

(Received February 21, 1972.)

#### REFERENCES

- [1] I. Vaduva: Contributii la teoria estimatiilor statistice ale densitatilor de repartie și aplicatii. Studii si cercetari Matematice 20 (1968), 8, 1207–1276.
- [2] M. A. Мирзахмедов: Об оценке многомерной плотности вероятности (On the estimation of a multivariate probability density). In: Научные труды Ташкентского государственного университета. Ташкент 1969, 146–150.
- [3] G. S. Watson, M. R. Leadbetter: On the estimation of the probability density I. Annals of Mathematical Statistics 34 (1963), 2, 480–491.
- [4] E. Parzen: On asymptotically efficient consistent estimates of the spectral density of a stationary time series. Journal Royal Statist. Soc. Ser. B 20 (1958), 2, 303–322.
- [5] G. B. Dvight: Tables of integrals and other mathematical data. New York 1961.

M. A. Mirzachmedov, Sh. A. Chashimov: Chair of Probability Theory and Mathematical Statistics of Tashkent State University, Tashkent, USSR.