

Some Theorems on Geometric Measure of Distortion

Y. D. MATHUR, J. MITTER*

In this paper the relationship between the rate of transmission of information and the geometric measure of distortion is established both in discrete and continuous cases. The geometric rate-distortion function is defined as the infimum of the average mutual information between the sets of input and output symbols under the constraint that geometric distortion measure does not exceed a distortion limit. The slope of the geometric rate-distortion curve is evaluated and a lower bound is obtained. Finally geometric rate-distortion function is constructed for symmetric distortion measure.

I. INTRODUCTION

Consider an M -letter independent source with input symbols $\{0, 1, \dots, M-1\}$ which are used to communicate over channel whose set of output symbols is $\{0, 1, \dots, N-1\}$. Let the channel matrix be $\{q_{ji}\}$ where q_{ji} is the probability of receiving j when i is sent. If the input distribution is $\{p_i\}_{i=0}^{M-1}$ then the output distribution $\{q_j\}_{j=0}^{N-1}$ is determined by

$$(1.1) \quad q_j = \sum_i p_i q_{ji} \quad \text{for all } j.$$

Further let q_{ij} denote the distortion when symbol i is received as j such that $q_{ij} > \alpha > 0$, $i \neq j$; $q_{ii} = \alpha$. If we denote the geometric mean of single letter distortions q_{ij} by ${}_a D_G$, then

$$(1.2) \quad {}_a D_G = \prod_{i,j} q_{ij}^{(p_i \cdot q_{ji})}.$$

* The author is thankful to C.S.I.R. (India) for financial assistance.

Also, the average mutual information $I(X; Y)$ (or $R(\{q_{j|i}\})$) between the input and output, is given by

$$(1.3) \quad I(X; Y) = R(\{q_{j|i}\}) = \sum_i \sum_j p_i q_{j|i} \log \frac{q_{j|i}}{\sum_l p_l q_{j|l}},$$

where logarithms are considered to the base 2.

On the lines of Shannon's rate-distortion function [4], Sharma, Mitter and Mathur have defined the geometric rate-distortion function $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ as

$$(1.4) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = \min R(\{q_{j|i}\}),$$

where the minimization is done with respect to all those $\{q_{j|i}\}$ for which ${}_ \alpha D_G \leq {}_\alpha D_G^*$, ${}_ \alpha D_G^*$ being a fixed quantity.

The measure defined in (1.2) has some advantages over the Shannon's measure of distortion given by

$$(1.5) \quad D = \sum_i \sum_j p_i \cdot q_{j|i} \cdot \varrho_{ij}.$$

Some relations that it bears with entropies of the system and the rate of transmission, have been given in [5]. Bounds on $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ when measure of distortion is symmetric i.e., $\varrho_{ij} = \beta > \alpha \forall i, j; i \neq j$ were obtained by Sharma and the authors in [6].

In the present communication, we obtain some expressions for $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ and study the nature of the geometric rate-distortion curve. A lower bound on $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ when the measure $\varrho_{ij} = \varrho(x; y)$ (continuous case) depends on the difference of x and y and its value when the measure is symmetric, are obtained herein.

II. THEOREMS ON ${}_ \alpha D_G$

Theorem 2.1. Let $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ be the geometric rate-distortion function of a discrete memoryless source with source probability $\{p_i\}$ and single letter distortion measure ϱ_{ij} , then $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ can be expressed as

$$(2.1) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = v \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^* \log {}_\alpha D_G^* + \sum_i p_i \log \mu_i,$$

where

$$(2.2) \quad \sum_i \mu_i p_i \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^*} = 1 \quad \text{for all } j,$$

and

$$(2.3) \quad \mu_i^{-1} = \sum_j q_j \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^*}, \quad \text{for all } i.$$

400 **Proof.** Proceeding as in Gallager [2], it can be shown that by constructing a function φ as

$$\varphi = I(X; Y) - v \cdot {}_x D_G^* + \sum_i S_i \sum_j q_{j|i},$$

where

$$\sum_j q_{j|i} = 1,$$

and differentiating it with respect to $q_{j|i}$, after setting $S_i = -p_i \log \mu_i$, the condition for $q_{j|i}$ to yield a stationary point for φ is that

$$(2.4) \quad q_{j|i} = \mu_i q_j \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*}, \quad \text{for all } i \text{ and } j$$

satisfying

$$\sum_i \mu_i p_i \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*} = 1 \quad \text{for all } j.$$

Further setting (2.4) in (1.3), we get

$$\begin{aligned} R({}_x D_G^*) &= \sum_i \sum_j p_i \mu_i q_j \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*} \log (\mu_i \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*}) = \\ &= v \cdot {}_x D_G^* \sum_i \sum_j p_i q_j \mu_i \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*} \log \varrho_{ij} + \sum_i \sum_j p_i q_j \mu_i \varrho_{ij}^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*} \log \mu_i = \\ &= v \cdot {}_x D_G^* \log {}_x D_G^* + \sum_i p_i \log \mu_i, \end{aligned}$$

using (2.3). □

The result can be analogously extended to continuous case. With similar notations, we have

$$(2.6) \quad R({}_x D_G^*) - \gamma \cdot {}_x D_G^* \log {}_x D_G^* = \int p(x) \ln \mu(x) dx$$

such that

$$\int \mu(x) p(x) \varrho^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*}(x; y) dx = 1 \quad \text{for all } y,$$

and

$$(2.6a) \quad \mu^{-1}(x) = \int q(y) \varrho^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^*}(x; y) dy,$$

where \ln denotes logarithms to the base e .

The parameter v admits of a geometrical interpretation which we now state below:

Theorem 2.2. The slope $R'({}_x D_G^*)$ of the geometric rate-distortion curve at ${}_x D_G^*$ is given by

$$(2.7) \quad R'({}_x D_G^*) = v \cdot \log (2 \cdot {}_x D_G^*).$$

Proof. From (2.1), it follows that $R({}_x D_G^*)$ is a function of $v, {}_x D_G^*$ and $\mu_i (i = 0, 1, \dots, M - 1)$. Thus, we have

$$\begin{aligned} R'({}_x D_G^*) &= \frac{dR({}_x D_G^*)}{d{}_x D_G^*} = \frac{\partial R}{\partial {}_x D_G^*} + \frac{\partial R}{\partial v} \left(\frac{dv}{d{}_x D_G^*} \right) + \sum_i \frac{\partial R}{\partial \mu_i} \left(\frac{d\mu_i}{d{}_x D_G^*} \right) = \\ &= v + v \cdot \log {}_x D_G^* + \left[{}_x D_G^* \log {}_x D_G^* + \sum_i \frac{p_i}{\mu_i} \left(\frac{d\mu_i}{dv} \right) \right] \frac{dv}{d{}_x D_G^*}. \end{aligned}$$

As the transverse the $R({}_x D_G^*)$ curve, the solution always satisfies (2.2), so that

$$\sum_i \left[\mu_i {}_x D_G^* \log \varrho_{ij} + \frac{d\mu_i}{dv} \right] p_i \varrho_{ij}^{v, {}_x D_G^*} = 0.$$

Multiplying this by q_j and summing over j , we obtain

$${}_x D_G^* \log {}_x D_G^* + \sum_i \frac{p_i}{\mu_i} \left(\frac{d\mu_i}{dv} \right) = 0.$$

This, in turn gives

$$R'({}_x D_G^*) = v + v \cdot \log {}_x D_G^*. \quad \square$$

Theorem 2.3. For a reproducing probability distribution $q = (q_0, q_1, \dots, q_{N-1})$ let $B_q = \{j : q_j = 0\}$ and $V_q = \{j : q_j > 0\}$ be the boundary and interior sets respectively. Then a conditional probability assignment $\{q_{j|i}\}$ such that

$$q_{j|i} = \mu_i q_j \varrho_{ij}^{v, {}_x D_G^*} \quad \text{for all } i \text{ and } j,$$

yields a point on the $R({}_x D_G^*)$ curve if and only if

$$(2.8) \quad \sum_i \mu_i p_i \varrho_{ij}^{v, {}_x D_G^*} \leq 1, \quad \text{for } j \in B_q,$$

where μ_i and v satisfy (2.3).

Proof. Let a change of transition probabilities $\Delta q_{j|i}$ be such that

$$(2.9) \quad \Delta q_{j|i} \geq 0, \quad \text{for } j \in B_q,$$

$$(2.10) \quad \sum_j \Delta q_{j|i} = 0$$

and

$$(2.11) \quad \Delta {}_x D_G = \exp \left[\sum_i \sum_j p_i \Delta q_{j|i} \log \varrho_{ij} \right] = \exp(0) = 1.$$

402 For V_q , the change in $I(X; Y)$ is given by

$$\Delta I_v = \sum_i \sum_{j \in V_q} p_i \Delta q_{j|i} \log \mu_i \varrho_{ij}^{v, \alpha D^* G}$$

(from 2.4) and for B_q , the change is

$$\Delta I_B = \sum_i \sum_{j \in B_q} p_i \Delta q_{j|i} \log \frac{\Delta q_{j|i}}{\Delta q_j}$$

Thus the total change is then given by

$$\Delta I = \sum_i \sum_{j \in V_q} p_i \cdot \Delta_{j|i} \{ \log \varrho_{ij}^{v, \alpha D^* G} + \log \mu_i \} + \sum_i \sum_{j \in B_q} p_i \cdot \Delta q_{j|i} \log \frac{\Delta q_{j|i}}{\Delta q_j}$$

By adding and subtracting the quantity

$$\sum_i \sum_{j \in B_q} p_i \cdot \Delta q_{j|i} \{ \log \varrho_{ij}^{v, \alpha D^* G} + \log \mu_i \},$$

we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta I &= \sum_i \sum_j p_i \cdot \Delta q_{j|i} \{ \log \varrho_{ij}^{v, \alpha D^* G} + \log \mu_i \} + \\ (2.12) \quad &+ \sum_i \sum_{j \in B_q} p_i \cdot \Delta q_{j|i} \log \left(\frac{\Delta q_{j|i}}{\Delta q_j \cdot \mu_i \varrho_{ij}^{v, \alpha D^* G}} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Invoking the constraints (2.10), (2.11), the first expression on the right hand side of (2.12) vanishes. Again by applying the inequality

$$(2.13) \quad \log x \geq 1 - \frac{1}{x} \quad (\text{with equality iff } x = 1)$$

to the second expression of right hand side of (2.12), we get

$$\Delta I \geq 0$$

if (2.8) holds.

This shows that any change of transition probabilities can only increase $I(X; Y)$ if ${}_x D_G$ is kept fixed when (2.8) holds, which implies that the above solution achieves the minimum of $I(X; Y)$. The second part of the theorem can be readily established by showing that the set of transition probabilities which does not satisfy (2.8), will decrease $I(X; Y)$, keeping ${}_x D_G$ fixed. \square

Theorem 2.4 (Another form of $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$). Let $\hat{\mu}$ be the set $\{\mu\}$ where $\mu = (\mu_0, \mu_1, \dots, \mu_{M-1})$ and $\mu_i > 0$ for each $i = 0, 1, \dots, M-1$ satisfying

$$(2.14) \quad \sum_i \mu_i \cdot p_i \cdot q_{ij}^{\nu, \alpha D_G^*} \leq 1 \quad \text{for all } j,$$

then

$$(2.15) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = \max_{\nu, \mu \in \hat{\mu}} (\nu \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^* \log {}_\alpha D_G^* + \sum_i p_i \cdot \log \mu_i)$$

and a necessary and sufficient condition for μ to achieve maximum in (2.15) is that its components be given by

$$(2.16) \quad \mu_i^{-1} = \sum_j q_j q_{ij}^{\nu, \alpha D_G^*}, \quad i = 0, 1, \dots, M-1.$$

Proof. From the assumption ${}_\alpha D_G \leq {}_\alpha D_G^*$ and making use of the inequality (2.14) and (2.13), we get

$$\begin{aligned} & R({}_\alpha D_G^*) - \nu \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^* \log {}_\alpha D_G^* - \sum_i p_i \cdot \log \mu_i \geq \\ & \geq \sum_i \sum_j p_i q_{ji} \left\{ 1 - \frac{q_j \cdot \mu_i q_{ij}^{\nu, \alpha D_G^*}}{q_{jii}} \right\} = 1 - \sum_j q_j \sum_i \mu_i p_i q_{ij}^{\nu, \alpha D_G^*} \geq 1 - \sum_j q_j = 0. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, for every set of conditional probabilities $\{q_{jii}\}$ for which ${}_\alpha D_G \leq {}_\alpha D_G^*$, $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ approaches the maximum on the right hand side of (2.15). Thus

$$(2.17) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) \geq \max_{\nu, \mu \in \hat{\mu}} (\nu \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^* \log {}_\alpha D_G^* + \sum_i p_i \log \mu_i);$$

we can easily see from Theorem 2.1, that

$$(2.18) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) \leq \max_{\nu, \mu \in \hat{\mu}} (\nu \cdot {}_\alpha D_G^* \log {}_\alpha D_G^* + \sum_i p_i \log \mu_i).$$

Thus combining (2.17) and (2.18), we obtain (2.15). The necessary and sufficient condition for achieving the maximum in the statement of the theorem follows immediately from Theorem 2.3. \square

In the next section, we shall come to a variational problem to find a lower bound of $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$. For that we shall need the continuous analog of Theorem 2.4 which may be stated as follows:

If $\hat{\mu}$ is the set of all non-negative functions $\mu(x)$ satisfying

$$(2.19) \quad \int \mu(x) p(x) q^{\nu, \alpha D_G^*}(x; y) dx \leq 1 \quad \text{for all } y$$

404 then

$$(2.20) \quad R({}_a D_G^*) = \text{Sup}_{v, \mu(x) \in \mathcal{M}} [v \cdot {}_a D_G^* \log {}_a D_G^* + \int p(x) \ln \mu(x) dx]$$

and a necessary and sufficient condition for $\mu(x)$ to achieve supremum in (2.20) is that there exists an output probability density function $q(y)$ satisfying (2.6a) for almost all y for which $q(y) < 0$. \square

III. A LOWER BOUND WHEN $\varrho(x; y) = \varrho(x - y)$

When the distortion $\varrho(x; y)$ depends upon the difference of x and y , we call it as difference distortion measure.

Theorem 3.1. If R_L denotes the lower bound of $R({}_a D_G^*)$ for difference distortion, then

$$(3.1) \quad R_L = H(x) - H(\psi(x)),$$

where $H(X)$ is input entropy, that is $-\int p(x) \log p(x)$,

$$(3.2) \quad \psi(x) = \frac{\varrho^{v \cdot {}_a D_G^{**} c}(x)}{\int \varrho^{v \cdot {}_a D_G^{**} c}(z) dz},$$

and ${}_a D_G^{**}$ is the value of ${}_a D_G^*$ for $z = x - y$.

Proof. Let us suppose that

$$(3.3) \quad \mu(x) = \frac{S}{p(x)},$$

where S is a constant.

If ${}_a D_G^{**}$ denotes the value of ${}_a D_G^*$ when $z = x - y$, then (2.19) gives

$$(3.4) \quad S \cdot \int \varrho^{v \cdot {}_a D_G^{**} c}(z) dz \leq 1.$$

Choosing S such that (3.4) holds with equality, it follows from (2.20) that

$$(3.5) \quad R({}_a D_G^{**}) \geq v \cdot {}_a D_G^{**} \ln {}_a D_G^{**} + H(x) - \ln \int \varrho^{v \cdot {}_a D_G^{**} c}(z) dz = R_L \quad (\text{say}).$$

Therefore,

$$(3.6) \quad R_L' = {}_a D_G^{**} \ln {}_a D_G^{**} - {}_a D_G^{**} \int (\ln \varrho(x)) \psi(x) dx$$

and

$$(3.7) \quad R_L'' = - \int \{ {}_x D_G^{**} \ln \varrho(x) \}^2 \cdot \psi(x) \, dx + \left(\int {}_x D_G^{**} \ln \varrho(x) \psi(x) \, dx \right)^2 .$$

From (3.7) it can be readily seen that $R_L'' \leq 0$, therefore R_L is convex \cap function of v . Hence, there exists the unique maximum at some v satisfying $R_L' = 0$, that is

$$(3.8) \quad {}_x D_G^{**} \ln {}_x D_G^{**} = {}_x D_G^{**} \int \ln \varrho(x) \psi(x) \, dx .$$

Suppose that the value of ${}_x D_G^{**} \ln {}_x D_G^{**}$ for v obtained from (3.8) be denoted by D_v , then from (3.5) it follows that

$$R_L = v D_v + H(x) - \ln \int \varrho^{v \cdot {}_x D_G^{**} \alpha}(z) \, dz = H(x) + \int \psi(x) \ln \psi(x) \, dx . \quad \square$$

IV. CONSTRUCTION OF $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ FOR A SYMMETRIC MEASURE OF DISTORTION

If the number of input and output symbols are the same and if the cost of every correct transmission is α and that of any incorrect transmission is β (obviously $\alpha < \beta$) so that

$$(4.1) \quad \varrho_{ij} = \begin{cases} \alpha & \text{if } i = j, \\ \beta & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

then we may refer to this as symmetric measure of distortion. We shall give a theorem on the construction of $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ for the symmetric measure of distortion. We first prove two lemmas.

Lemma 1. Let $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ be defined for some source X with probability $P = \{p_0, p_1, \dots, p_{M-1}\}$ and distortion matrix $\{\varrho_{ij}\}$ and suppose the new distortions are formed by multiplying each row of the distortion matrix by a constant i.e.,

$$\hat{\varrho}_{ij} = C_i \cdot \varrho_{ij},$$

then

$$(4.2) \quad \hat{R}({}_\alpha D_G^*) = R({}_\alpha D_G^*/C),$$

where $C = 2^{\sum p_i \log C_i}$ and \hat{R} is defined for the source X and distortion $\hat{\varrho}_{ij}$.

Proof. We know that

$$\hat{R}({}_\alpha D_G^*) = \min I(X; Y)$$

406 subject to the constraint

$$(4.3) \quad 2^{\sum_j p_j q_{ji} \log \varrho_{ij}} \leq {}_a D_G^*$$

or

$$2^{\sum_j p_j q_{ji} \log \rho_{ij}} \leq {}_a D_G^* / C,$$

which by definition is $R({}_a D_G^* / C)$. □

Lemma 2. Let p_0 be the probability of the source letter corresponding to a row with all entries 1 in the distortion matrix. Then

$$(4.4) \quad R({}_a D_G^*) = (1 - p_0) \hat{R}({}_a D_G^*)^{1/(1-p_0)},$$

where \hat{R} is defined for the distortion matrix with row of 1's deleted, the source being $(1, 2, \dots, M - 1)$ with input probability distribution

$$(4.5) \quad p^* = \left(\frac{p_1}{1 - p_0}, \frac{p_2}{1 - p_0}, \dots, \frac{p_{M-1}}{1 - p_0} \right).$$

Proof. The geometric distortion ${}_a D_G$ is not affected by omitting the distortion corresponding to the reproduction of source letter O. Thus to minimize $I(X; Y)$ we must choose q_{jji} so that $I(x_0, Y) = 0$. With this choice

$$\begin{aligned} R({}_a D_G^*) &= \min I(X; Y) = \\ &= \min \left[p_0 I(x_0; Y) + \sum_{i=1}^{M-1} p_i I(x_i; Y) \right] = \\ &= \min \left[(1 - p_0) \sum_{i=1}^{M-1} \frac{p_i}{1 - p_0} I(x_i; Y) \right]. \end{aligned}$$

The constraint is

$$\sum_{i=0}^{M-1} \sum_j p_i q_{jji} \log \varrho_{ij} = \log {}_a D_G^*.$$

But

$$\sum_j q_{jjo} \log \varrho_{oj} = 0.$$

Therefore,

$$\sum_{i=1}^{M-1} \sum_j \frac{p_i}{1 - p_0} q_{jji} \log \varrho_{ij} = \frac{1}{1 - p_0} \log {}_a D_G^* = \log ({}_a D_G^*)^{1/(1-p_0)}.$$

So by the definition of $R({}_a D_G^*)$, we obtain the desired result. □

Theorem 4.1. Under symmetric measure of distortion

$$(4.6) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = (1 - \sigma_{K-1}) [H_{M-K+1}(X) - \hat{H}(\Delta_{K-1}) - \Delta_{K-1} \log(M - K)]$$

for

$${}_a D_G^{*(K-1)} < {}_a D_G^* \leq {}_a D_G^{*(K)}, \quad \text{for } 2 \leq K < M + 1,$$

where

$$(4.7) \quad \sigma_K = \sum_{i=0}^{K-1} p_i, \quad \text{for } K \geq 1; \quad \sigma_0 \equiv 0,$$

$${}_a D_G^{*(K)} = \beta^{\sigma_{K-1}} \left[\alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M - K) \frac{p_{K-1}}{1 - \sigma_{K-1}} \right]^{1 - \sigma_{K-1}}$$

and

$$(4.8) \quad \Delta_K = \left\{ \frac{\left(\frac{{}_a D_G^*}{\beta^{\sigma_K}} \right)^{1/(1 - \sigma_K)} - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha} \right\},$$

$$\hat{H}(\Delta_K) = -\Delta_K \log \Delta_K - (1 - \Delta_K) \log(1 - \Delta_K);$$

also $H_{M-K}(X)$ is the entropy of the source $(p_K/(1 - \sigma_K), \dots, p_{M-1}/(1 - \sigma_K))$, provided that $p_0 \leq p_1 \leq \dots \leq p_{M-1}$.

Proof. We have indicated in Theorem 2.1 that the set $\{q_{j|i}\}$ giving $R({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ is given by

$$q_{j|i} = q_j \mu_i \rho_{ij}^{\alpha D^* G} \quad \text{for all } i \text{ and } j,$$

where q_j 's satisfy the constraint

$$(4.9) \quad \mu_i \sum_j q_j \rho_{ij}^{\alpha D^* G} = 1 \quad \text{for all } i.$$

For symmetric measure of distortion, it has been shown in [6] that

$$(4.10) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) \geq H(X) - \hat{H}(\Delta) - \Delta \log(M - 1),$$

where $H(X)$ is the source entropy,

$$\Delta = \frac{{}_a D_G^* - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha}$$

408 and

$$\hat{H}(\Delta) = -\Delta \log \Delta - (1 - \Delta) \log (1 - \Delta)$$

with equality in (4.10) if

$$(4.11) \quad {}_x D_G^* \leq \alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M - 1) p_0,$$

p_0 is the minimum input probability and q_j in (4.9) under this measure is given by

$$(4.12) \quad q_j = \frac{p_j [\beta^{\lambda\beta} + (M - 1) \alpha^{\lambda\alpha}] - \alpha^{\lambda\alpha}}{\beta^{\lambda\beta} - \alpha^{\lambda\alpha}}.$$

All q_j 's will be non-negative if

$$(4.13) \quad p_j \geq \frac{1}{\beta^{\lambda\beta} \alpha^{-\lambda\alpha} + (M - 1)}.$$

Denote

$$(4.14) \quad {}_x D_G^* = \alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M - 1) p_0 = {}_x D_G^{*(1)}.$$

Then for ${}_x D_G^* > {}_x D_G^{*(1)}$ [3], output zero will never be used and we can therefore remove it from the output alphabet and delete the corresponding column from the distortion matrix without affecting $R({}_x D_G^*)$. Thus for ${}_x D_G^* > {}_x D_G^{*(1)}$ we have $M \times (M - 1)$ distortion matrix $\{q_{ij}\}$ with all β 's in the first row. Dividing the first row by β and using Lemma 1, we have

$$(4.15) \quad R({}_x D_G^*) = R^{(1)}({}_x D_G^* / \beta^{p_0}),$$

where $R^{(1)}$ corresponds to the matrix

$$(4.16) \quad \{q_{ij}^{(1)}\} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & \dots & 1 \\ \alpha & \beta & \dots & \beta \\ \cdot & \cdot & \dots & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \dots & \cdot \\ \cdot & \cdot & \dots & \cdot \\ \beta & \beta & \dots & \alpha \end{bmatrix}.$$

Using Lemma 2, we get

$$(4.17) \quad R^{(1)}({}_x D_G^*) = (1 - p_0) R^{(2)}({}_x D_G^*)^{1/(1-p_0)}.$$

From (4.15) and (4.17), we have

$$(4.18) \quad R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = (1 - p_0) R^{(2)}(({}_\alpha D_G^* / \beta^{p_0})^{1/(1-p_0)})$$

for ${}_x D_G^* > {}_\alpha D_G^{*(1)}$ and $R^{(2)}$ corresponds to the $(M-1) \times (M-1)$ matrix and the source

$$p^{**} = \left(\frac{p_1}{1-p_0}, \frac{p_2}{1-p_0}, \dots, \frac{p_{M-1}}{1-p_0} \right).$$

A lower bound of $R^2({}_\alpha D_G^*)$ can be obtained similarly which is valid for

$${}_x D_G^* \leq \alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M-2) \frac{p_1}{1-p_0},$$

where p_1 is the second lowest probability. Thus the second break point occurs at ${}_x D_G^{*(2)}$, where

$$({}_x D_G^{*(2)} / \beta^{p_0})^{1/(1-p_0)} = \alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M-2) \frac{p_1}{1-p_0}.$$

Hence

$$R({}_\alpha D_G^*) = H(X) - \hat{H} \left(\frac{{}_x D_G^* - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha} \right) - \left(\frac{{}_x D_G^* - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha} \right) \log(M-1)$$

for

$${}_x D_G^* \leq \alpha \log \alpha + (\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha) (M-1) p_0$$

and

$$R({}_x D_G^*) = (1 - p_0) \left[H_{M-1}(X) - \hat{H} \left\{ \frac{({}_x D_G^* / \beta^{p_0})^{1/(1-p_0)} - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha} \right\} - \left\{ \frac{({}_x D_G^* / \beta^{p_0})^{1/(1-p_0)} - \alpha \log \alpha}{\beta \log \beta - \alpha \log \alpha} \right\} \log(M-2) \right]$$

for

$${}_x D_G^{*(1)} < {}_x D_G^* \leq {}_x D_G^{*(2)},$$

where

$$H_{M-1}(X) = - \sum_{i=1}^{M-1} \frac{p_i}{1-p_0} \log \frac{p_i}{1-p_0}.$$

Continuing this way, we get the desired result. \square

Acknowledgement. We express our sincere thanks to Dr. B. D. Sharma, Reader in the Faculty of Mathematics, Delhi University for the help and guidance in the preparation of this paper and to the referees of this paper for his helpful comments.

(Received January 31, 1973.)

REFERENCES

- [1] T. Berger: Rate Distortion Theory. Prentice Hall, N. J., 1971.
- [2] R. G. Gallager: Information Theory and Reliable Communication. Wiley, N. Y. 1968.
- [3] J. T. Pinkston: An Application of Rate Distortion Theory to a Converse to the Coding Theorem. IEEE Trans. Information Theory *IT-15* (1969), 56–61.
- [4] C. E. Shannon: Coding Theorems for a discrete source with a fidelity criterion. In: Information and Decision Processes (Ed. R. E. Machol). McGraw Hill, N. Y. 1960.
- [5] B. D. Sharma, J. Mitter, Y. D. Mathur: Geometric Measure of Distortion, *Statistica. XXXIII* (1973) 4, 589–597 (Bologna).
- [6] B. D. Sharma, Y. D. Mathur, J. Mitter: Bounds on the Rate-distortion function for geometric measure of distortion. *Revue Francaise d'Automatique, Informatique et Recherche Operationnelle* (1973), R-2, 29–38.

Y. D. Mathur, J. Mitter; Department of Mathematics, University of Delhi, Delhi-7. India.